1 2 3 4 5 6 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 7 EASTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON 8 DAWIT HABTEGIORGIS, NO: CV-08-3077-RMP 9 Plaintiff, STIPULATED PROTECTIVE 10 **ORDER** VS. 11 OIC OF WASHINGTON, 12 Defendant. 13 BEFORE the Court is the Parties Motion for Protective Order (Ct. Rec. 14 151) and the Parties Motion to Expedite the same (Ct. Rec. 148). The parties, by 15 their signature below, stipulate to the following: 16 1. BACKGROUND AND RECITALS 17 Only July 1, 2010, the Court ordered electronic discovery to be produced. 18 Due to defendant's confidentiality concerns (Ct. Rec. 123 at p. 3, lns. 24-27), the 19 Court also ruled that the defendant would be allowed an opportunity to redact any 20 [PROPOSED] STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER - 1 LARSON BERG & PERKINS PLLC 105 North 3rd Street P.O. Box 550

> Yakima, WA 98907 (509) 457-1515 (509) 457-1027 (fax)

Case 2:08-cv-03077-RMP Document 154 Filed 09/08/10

"confidential information, such as clients' social security numbers," prior to providing the results to the plaintiff. (Ct. Rec. 123 at p. 4, lns. 14 - 19). At the conclusion of the searches, plaintiff left the documents with defendant to be redacted.

On August 25, 2010, defense counsel contacted plaintiff's counsel, via email, to propose a stipulated protective order. Defendant's allege reasons for the protective order are: (1) that the results of those searches are quite voluminous, yielding approximately 60,000 pages of documents; (2) that the redaction process would be very time consuming and expensive; (3) as a general proposition, it is anticipated that any use of these documents during this litigation will probably not hinge upon such confidential information, but, rather, will probably be based upon other substantive information within the documents; and (4) both sides have an interest in keeping this litigation moving, without any further delays.

On all accounts, the parties and their respective counsel believe that entry of an appropriate Stipulated Protective Order should suffice to protect the defendant's interest, rather than requiring the defendant to redact the documents. Accordingly, the parties respectfully ask the Court to enter a Stipulated Protective Order to protect the documents retrieved as a result of the searches conducted pursuant to the Court's Order at Ct. Rec. 123, p. 4, lns. 9 - 20.

 $[PROPOSED] \ STIPULATED \ PROTECTIVE \ ORDER - 2$

LARSON BERG & PERKINS PLLC 105 North 3rd Street P.O. Box 550 Yakima, WA 98907 (509) 457-1515 (509) 457-1027 (fax)

2. TERMS OF THE STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

A. The documents from the above-referenced ten (10) searches will be provided by duplicate DVDs and shall only be used for purposes of this litigation. Defendant represents that only the results of the above-referenced completed searches have been saved to duplicate DVDs to be provided to the plaintiff. Such documents shall not be disclosed or provided to anyone or any entity other than the parties to this litigation, the attorneys of record for the parties, and to the Court, or as directed by the Court.

- B. In the event that any party desires to use any portion of such information or documents during the pre-trial portion of this litigation (*i.e.*, during motion practice, during other discovery such as depositions, etc.), the offering party shall make a "good faith" effort to redact the following items:
 - 1. Names of the defendant's clients/customers;
 - 2. Addresses and telephone numbers of the defendant's clients/customers; and
 - 3. Social security numbers and other identification information of the defendant's clients/customers.
- C. In the event that the non-offering party believes that the offering party has failed to comply with the redaction requirements of subparts "B." above, counsel for non-offering party shall attempt to confer with counsel for the [PROPOSED] STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER 3

 LARSON BERG & PERKINS PLLC

105 North 3rd Street P.O. Box 550 Yakima, WA 98907 (509) 457-1515 (509) 457-1027 (fax)

	I
	2
	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	8
	9
1	0
1	1
1	2
1	3
1	4
1	5
1	6
1	7

offering party in an attempt to resolve the dispute. If counsel for the offering
party agrees that additional items or information should have been redacted,
the preferred method of correcting the matter shall be for the offering party to file
one or more amended pleadings and to request the Court to strike/withdrawal the
original pleading(s) wherein insufficient redactions were applied. By contrast,
if counsel for the offering party disagrees that additional items or information
should have been redacted, the non-offering party (following the actual or
attempted conference between counsel) may elect to file one or more motions
seeking appropriate relief.

- D. During trial, all decisions regarding redaction of any information or items shall be made by the presiding Judge.
- E. Within thirty (30) calendar days following the conclusion of this litigation (including any appeals), the plaintiff shall return to the defendant all documents and information (including all physical copies and electronic copies) contained on the above-referenced duplicate DVDs. In addition, the restrictions within subpart "A." above shall remain operative and binding, even after conclusion of this litigation. Accordingly,

18

19

20

1	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:
2	1. Parties Motion to Expedite (Ct. Rec. 148) is GRANTED.
3	2. Parties Motion for Protective Order (Ct. Rec. 151) is GRANTED.
4	3. The operative provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order (as
5	contained within subparts "A." through "E." above) are adopted and entered as a
6	binding Order of this Court.
7	The District Court Executive is directed to enter this Order and provide
8	copies to counsel.
9	DATED this 8th day of September, 2010.
10	
1.1	s/Rosanna Malouf Peterson
11	ROSANNA MALOUF PETERSON United States District Court Judge
12	United States District Court Judge
13	
14	Presented jointly by:
15	s/D. R. (Rob) Case
16	D. R. (Rob) Case, WSBA #34313 LARSON BERG & PERKINS PLLC
17	Among Attorneys for Defendant OIC of Washington
17	105 North Third Street
18	Yakima, WA 98901 Phone: (500) 457, 1515
	Phone: (509) 457-1515 Fax: (509) 457-1027
19	Email: Rob@LBPlaw.com
20	
	[PROPOSED] STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER - 5 LARSON BERG & PERKINS PLLC 105 North 3rd Street

LARSON BERG & PERKINS PLLC 105 North 3rd Street P.O. Box 550 Yakima, WA 98907 (509) 457-1515 (509) 457-1027 (fax)

1	s/ Tanya Khodr
2	Tanya Khodr, WSBA #34300 KHODR & WINKELHAKE, P.L.L.C. Attorneys for Plaintiff
3	323 Queen Anne Avenue N., Suite 102
4	Seattle, WA 98109 Phone: (206) 384-1886
5	Fax: (206) 274-4829 Email: TKhodr@KLlegal.org
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	

[PROPOSED] STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER - 6

LARSON BERG & PERKINS PLLC 105 North 3rd Street P.O. Box 550 Yakima, WA 98907 (509) 457-1515 (509) 457-1027 (fax)